Florida Coastal Law and Policy: Cases and Readings

Donna R. Christie
CIRCULATING COPY
Sea Grant Depository

FLORIDA COASTAL LAW AND POLICY: CASES AND READINGS

By

Donna R. Christie
Assistant Professor of Law

Florida State University
College of Law
Tallahassee, Florida 32306

Copyright 1985 by Donna R. Christie
and
Florida Sea Grant College Program
ISBN 0-912747-01-3

Sea Grant Project No. IR-83-5
Grant No. NA80AA-D-0038

Report Number 75
Florida Sea Grant College
August 1985
Price $6.00
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>PREFACE</strong></td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>COASTAL LAW: AN OVERVIEW.</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART ONE. THE COAST: AN INTRODUCTION.</strong></td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Section 1. COASTAL ECOSYSTEMS AND IMPACT OF COASTAL DEVELOPMENT.</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Department of Commerce, Who's Minding the Shore?</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Citizens Guide to Coastal Zone Management.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Section 2. FEDERAL COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT.</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Coastal Zone Management Act of 1972, S. Rep. No. 753</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Belsky, Book Review.</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Section 3. FLORIDA'S COASTAL ZONE.</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Livingston, The Apalachicola Experiment: Research and Management.</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Section 4. RECOMMENDED READINGS.</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART TWO. PUBLIC AND PRIVATE RIGHTS IN THE COASTAL ZONE.</strong></td>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Section 1. STATE OWNERSHIP OF SUBMERGED AND TIDAL LANDS.</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SHIVELY v. BOWLEY</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>STATE v. GERBING</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NOTES</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Section 2. THE BOUNDARY BETWEEN PUBLIC AND PRIVATE LANDS</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BORAX CONSOLIDATED LTD. V. LOS ANGELES</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Section 3. AMBULATORY BOUNDARIES

Maloney and Ausness, The Use and Legal Significance of the Mean High Water Line in Coastal Boundary Mapping.

HUGHES v. WASHINGTON

STATE v. FLORIDA NATIONAL PROPERTIES, INC.

OREGON EX REL. STATE LAND BOARD v. CORVALLIS SAND AND GRAVEL CO.

CALIFORNIA EX REL. STATE LANDS COMMISSION v. UNITED STATES

BOARD OF TRUSTEES, ETC. v. MEDEIRA BEACH NAM., INC.

Section 3. THE SIGNIFICANCE OF PUBLIC OWNERSHIP

A. The Public Trust Doctrine

ILLINOIS CENTRAL RAILROAD COMPANY v. ILLINOIS

MARKS v. WHITNEY

STATE v. GERBING

NOTES

B. State Divestiture of Public Trust Lands

CONSTITUTION OF THE STATE OF FLORIDA ART. X, Section 11

ODOM v. DELTONA CORP.
STATE v. CONTEMPORARY LAND SALES.................102
NOTES.............................................105
C. Public Rights in Navigable Waters...............114
THE DANIEL BALL......................................114
BROWARD v. MABRY....................................117
NOTES.............................................117
CLEMENT v. WATSON.................................118
KAISER AETNA v. UNITED STATES......................120
NOTES.............................................128
Section 4. PUBLIC ACCESS TO BEACHES...................128
GION v. CITY OF SANTA CRUZ; DIETZ v. KING..........128
STATE EX REL. THORNTON v. HAY......................136
CITY OF DAYTONA BEACH v. TONA-RAMA, INC............139
Maloney, Fernandez, Parrish & Reinders, Public
Beach Access: A Guaranteed Place to
Spread Your Towel..................................144
NOTES.............................................145
Section 5. RIGHTS OF RIPARIAN OWNERS..................151
BOARD of TRUSTEES v. MEDEIRA BEACH NOM., INC.....152
GAME & FRESH WATER FISH COM'N v. LAKE ISLAND.....153
UNITED STATES v. CHANDLER-DUNBAR WATER POWER CO...162
COLBERG, INC. v. STATE................................165
Section 6. THE TAKING ISSUE.............................169
GRAHAM v. ESTUARY PROPERTIES, INC....................171
KEY HAVEN ASSOCIATED ENTERPRISES, INC. v. BOARD
OF TRUSTEES OF INTERNAL IMPROVEMENT TRUST
FUND..............................................179
NOTES.............................................185
PART THREE. FLORIDA'S COASTAL ZONE PLANNING: A STUDY IN GOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS...186

Section 1. INTRODUCTION..........................................186

Section 2. FEDERAL AND STATE BOUNDARIES..............186

The Tidelands Controversy.................................186

UNITED STATES v. CALIFORNIA.............................133

The Submerged Lands Act of 1953.........................197

UNITED STATES v. FLORIDA (1960)......................194

NOTES.........................................................196

UNITED STATES v. FLORIDA (1976)......................197

NOTES.........................................................199

Section 3. FISHERIES MANAGEMENT.......................203

A. State Fisheries Management.........................203

Schoenbaum & McDonald, State Management of Marine Fisheries After the Fishery Conservation and Management Act of 1976 and Douglas v. Seacoast Products, Inc...............203

DOUGLAS, COMMISSIONER, VIRGINIA MARINE RESOURCES COMMISSION v. SEACOAST PRODUCTS INC.........................................................207

B. Federal Fisheries Management.....................216

Greenberg & Shapiro, Federalism in the Fishery Conservation Zone: A New Role for the States in an Era of Federal Regulatory Reform......................215

NOTES.........................................................219

C. State Fisheries Management After The MFCMA......219

SOUTHEASTERN FISHERIES ASSOCIATION v. DEPT. OF NATURAL RESOURCES..........................220

PEOPLE v. WEEKEN...........................................222

ANDERSON SEAFOODS, INC. v. GRAHAM..................226

NOTES.........................................................229
Section 4. THE COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT ACT of 1972

NOTES..................................................237

AMERICAN PETROLEUM INSTITUTE v. KNECHT..................238

NOTES..................................................239

Section 5. THE FEDERAL CONSISTENCY REQUIREMENT.....264

Federal Consistency Matrix..................................267

SECRETARY OF INTERIOR v. CALIFORNIA.......................269

NOTES..................................................279

KEAN v. WATT.............................................279

CAPE MAY GREENE v. WARREN................................283

NOTES..................................................284

Section 6. FLORIDA'S COASTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN........298

Section 7. FLORIDA'S COASTAL ZONE BOUNDARIES.......304

Section 8. COMPREHENSIVE PLANNING.........................305

Finnell, Coastal Land Management in Florida..............305

The 1984 State and Regional Planning Act................311

Rhodes & Apgar, Charting Florida's Course: The State and Regional Planning Act of 1984......311

NOTES..................................................319

Local Government Comprehensive Planning..................320

Arlene, The Consistency Mandate of the Local Government Comprehensive Planning Act........322

NOTES..................................................331

Regional Planning Councils..................................337

Section 9. DEVELOPMENTS OF REGIONAL IMPACT..............341

GRAHAM v. ESTUARY PROPERTIES...............................341

Florida Statutes, Section 380.06............................345

NOTES..................................................348
Section 10. THE AREA OF CRITICAL STATE CONCERN PROGRAM. 357
    ASKEW v. CROSS KEYS WATERWAYS..........................357
    THE CRITICAL AREA PROGRAM SUMMARIZED...............364

Section 11. SPECIAL MANAGEMENT AREAS AND LAND ACQUISITIONS PROGRAMS.................369
    FLORIDA'S AQUATIC PRESERVE SYSTEM.........................369
    FLORIDA'S STATE WILDERNESS SYSTEM........................371
    CONSERVATION AND RECREATION LANDS:
        ENVIRONMENTALLY ENDANGERED LANDS.....................373

Section 12. PROTECTION OF BEACHES, DUNES, AND BARRIER ISLANDS.......................377
    Maloney and O'Donnell, Drawing the Line at the Oceanfront: The Role of Coastal Construction Setback Lines in Regulating Development of the Coastal Zone..........................377

NOTES..............................................................387

CONCLUSION: THE FUTURE OF COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT IN FLORIDA.......................383
The 1985 session of the Florida legislature produced landmark legislation in the area of coastal land use and resources management. The Growth Management Act and the Coastal Zone Protection Act of 1985, following on the heels of major water resources and wetlands protection acts in 1983 and 1984, can again make Florida a leader in environmental protection and coastal management. This year is, therefore, particularly appropriate for the publication of a book on Florida coastal law.

Coastal law courses are becoming common in graduate programs and law schools, and they are different because they focus on a place rather than a generally recognized field of law. The important interrelations of water, habitat, wildlife, and land use, the jurisdictional conflicts, and even the difficulty of establishing a boundary make the coast unique. Coastal law involves aspects of land use law, water law, natural resources law, property law, and even constitutional law, but in the perspective of the special needs of the coast. This book is intended to provide a text for coastal law courses in Florida, as well as provide a general reference book for attorneys, legislators, agencies, and the public.

For sake of brevity and to keep the text relatively uncluttered, footnotes and citations are omitted except where considered particularly significant. The original number of a footnote in the quoted text is indicated in parentheses.

Acknowledgements

This book was developed under the auspices of the Florida Sea Grant Program with support from the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, Office of Sea Grant, U.S. Department of Commerce, Grant No. NAGOAA-D-00038.

This book contains the works of many authors, and I appreciate their cooperation in allowing me to reprint excerpts of their works. I would also like to thank Professor Martin Belsky, University of Florida College of Law, for his support during the development of the manuscript. I owe a debt of gratitude to too many helpful people in the state agencies and legislative committees to name them all, but I want to thank particularly Richard Tucker of the Florida Office of Coastal Management, who not only helped with research, but spent many hours reviewing and proofreading the manuscript as well.
This work is a result of research sponsored by NOAA Office of Sea Grant, Department of Commerce, under Grant No. NOAAGA-D-00038. The U.S. Government is authorized to produce and distribute reprints for governmental purposes notwithstanding any copyright notation that may appear hereon.

Donna R. Christie